

STANDARDS OF REVIEW OUTLINE

SEPTEMBER 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Definitions	1
A. Standard of Review	1
1. Definitions	1
2. Applications	2
B. De Novo	4
1. Definitions	4
2. Applications	5
C. Clearly Erroneous	7
1. Definitions	7
2. Applications	8
D. Abuse of Discretion	9
1. Definitions	9
2. Applications	10
E. Arbitrary and Capricious	12
1. Definitions	12
2. Applications	13

F.	Substantial Evidence	15
	1. Definitions	15
	2. Applications	16
	a. Agency Determinations	16
	b. Jury Verdicts	17
G.	Reasonableness	18
	1. Definitions	18
	2. Applications	19
II.	Criminal Proceedings	20
A.	Introduction	20
	1. Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law	20
	2. Harmless Error	22
	3. Plain Error	24
	4. Structural Error	26
B.	Pretrial Decisions in Criminal Cases	27
	1. Appointment of Expert Witness	27
	2. Bail	28
	3. Bill of Particulars	28
	4. Brady Violations	29
	5. Competency to Stand Trial	29
	6. Confessions	30
	7. Consolidation of Counts	31
	8. Continuances	31
	9. Defenses	32

10.	Discovery	32
	a. Bill of Particulars	34
	b. Brady Materials	34
	c. Confidential Informants	35
	d. Depositions	35
	e. Jencks Act	35
	f. Sanctions	36
11.	Discriminatory (Selective) Prosecution	37
12.	Dismissals	38
13.	Evidentiary Hearings	41
14.	Ex Parte Hearings	42
15.	Ex Post Facto	42
16.	Extradition	43
17.	Faretta Requests	44
18.	Franks Hearing	44
19.	Fugitive Status	44
20.	Grand Juries	45
21.	Guilty Pleas	46
	a. Rule 11	46
	b. Voluntariness	46
	c. Withdrawal	47
22.	Immunity Agreements	47
23.	In Camera Proceedings	48
24.	Indictments and Informations	48
	a. Constructive Amendments	48
	b. Dismissals	49
	c. Duplicitous/Multiplicitous	52
	d. Misjoinder	53
	e. Prosecutorial Misconduct	53
	f. Sufficiency	54
	g. Validity	55
25.	In Limine Orders	55
26.	Interpreters	55
27.	Investigators	56
28.	Judicial Estoppel	56

29.	Judicial Notice	56
30.	Jurisdiction	56
31.	Jury Demand	57
32.	Jury Waiver	57
33.	Juveniles	57
34.	Lack of Prosecution	58
35.	Law of the Case	59
36.	Lineups	59
37.	Magistrate Judges	59
38.	Miranda Rights	61
39.	Motion to Quash	63
40.	Out-of-Court Identification	63
41.	Plea Agreements	64
	a. Breaches/Enforcement	64
	b. Interpretation	65
	c. Negotiations	65
	d. Waiver	65
42.	Preclusion of Defense	66
43.	Preindictment Delay	66
44.	Pretrial Detention and Release	67
45.	Pretrial Hearings	67
46.	Pretrial Identifications	68
47.	Probable Cause	68
48.	Recusal	70
49.	Regulations	71
50.	Representation	71
	a. Conflict-Free Representation	71
	b. Disqualification of Counsel	71
	c. Hybrid Representation	71
	d. Ineffective Representation	72
	e. Pro Se Representation	74
	f. Right to Counsel	74
	g. Substitution of Counsel	75
	h. Waiver of Representation	75
	i. Withdrawal of Counsel	76

51.	Sealed Materials	76
52.	Search and Seizure	76
	a. Abandonment	77
	b. Border Searches	77
	c. Coast Guard Searches	78
	d. Consent to Search	78
	e. Exclusionary Rule	79
	f. Exigent Circumstances	79
	g. Expectation of Privacy	79
	h. Governmental Conduct	80
	i. Inevitable Discovery	80
	j. Investigatory Stops	80
	k. Issuance of a Search Warrant	81
	l. Knock and Announce	82
	m. Private Searches	83
	n. Probable Cause	83
	o. Probation/Parole Searches	85
	p. Protective Sweeps	85
	q. Reasonable Suspicion	86
	r. Rule 41(e) Motions	86
	s. Suppression Motions	87
	t. Terry Stops	88
	u. Warrantless Searches and Seizures	88
53.	Selective Prosecution	89
54.	Severance	90
55.	Sixth Amendment Rights	91
56.	Speedy Trial	93
57.	Statutes	95
58.	Statutes of Limitation	97
59.	Suppression	97
60.	Transfer of Trial	98
61.	Venue	98
62.	Vindictive Prosecution	98
63.	Voluntariness of a Confession	99
64.	Waiver of Rights	100
65.	Warrants	102
66.	Wiretaps	103

C.	Trial Decisions in Criminal Cases	104
1.	Acquittals	104
2.	Admission of Evidence	105
3.	Allen Charges	107
4.	Authenticity	107
5.	Batson Claims	107
6.	Best Evidence Rule	108
7.	Bruton Violations	108
8.	Burden of Proof	109
9.	Chain of Custody	109
10.	Character Evidence	109
11.	Closing Arguments	110
12.	Coconspirator Statements	110
13.	Comments on the Evidence	112
14.	Confrontation Clause	112
15.	Constitutionality of Regulations	113
16.	Constitutionality of Statutes	114
17.	Contempt	115
18.	Continuances	115
19.	Credibility Determinations	116
20.	Cross-Examination	117
21.	Documentary Evidence	118
22.	Double Jeopardy	118
23.	Entrapment	120
24.	Evidentiary Rulings	120
25.	Expert Testimony	123
26.	Extrinsic Evidence	124
27.	Federal Rules	125
28.	Fifth Amendment Rights	125
29.	Griffin Violations	126
30.	Hearsay	126
31.	Immunity from Prosecution	127
32.	Impeachment Evidence	128
33.	In Absentia Proceedings	128
34.	In-Court Identification	129
35.	Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	129
36.	Jewell Instruction	130

37.	Judge Conduct	130
38.	Juror Misconduct	131
39.	Jury Examination of Evidence	133
40.	Jury Inquiries	134
41.	Jury Instructions	135
42.	Jury Selection	139
	a. Challenges for Cause	139
	b. Jury Composition	140
	c. Peremptory Challenges	141
	d. Voir Dire	141
43.	Materiality of a False Statement	142
44.	Opening Statements	143
45.	Opinion Evidence	143
	a. Expert Opinion Evidence	143
	b. Lay Opinion Testimony	145
46.	Photographs	145
47.	Presence of Defendant	145
48.	Prior Crimes, Wrongs or Acts	146
49.	Privileges	147
50.	Probative Value vs. Prejudicial Harm	148
51.	Prosecutorial Misconduct	149
52.	Rebuttal and Surrebuttal Evidence	151
53.	Recess	152
54.	Recusal and Disqualification of Judge	152
55.	Relevancy of Evidence	152
56.	Reopening	153
57.	Rule of Completeness	153
58.	Sanctions	153
59.	Shackling	154
60.	Side Bar Conferences	155
61.	Supplemental Jury Instructions	155
62.	Verdict Forms	155
63.	Vouching	156
64.	Witnesses	156

D.	Post-Trial Decisions in Criminal Cases	158	
1.	Allocution	158	
2.	Appeals	158	
3.	Apprendi Violations	159	
4.	Arrest of Judgment	159	
5.	Attorneys Fees	160	
6.	Bail Pending Sentence and Appeal	160	
7.	Correcting/Amending/Reducing Sentences	161	
8.	Disciplinary Orders	161	
9.	Excusable Neglect	161	
10.	Expungement	162	
11.	Fines	162	
12.	Forfeiture	162	
13.	Mistrial	163	
14.	New Trial	164	
15.	Parole	165	
16.	Probation	165	
17.	Resentencing	166	
18.	Restitution	167	
19.	Rule 32	168	
20.	Sentencing	168	
	a.	Application of Guidelines	169
	b.	Constitutionality	170
	c.	Continuances	171
	d.	Correcting/Amending/Reducing Sentences	171
	e.	Departures	171
	f.	Disparate Sentences	173
	g.	Factual Findings	173
	h.	Fines	175
	i.	Interpretation of Guidelines	173
	j.	Legality	177
	k.	Restitution	178
	l.	Rule 32	179
21.	Sufficiency of the Evidence	179	
22.	Supervised Release	180	
23.	Transcripts	182	

24.	Writ Ad Testificandum	183
25.	Writ of Audita Querela	183
26.	Writ of Coram Nobis	183
E.	Habeas Corpus Petitions	184
1.	§ 2241	184
2.	§ 2255	185
3.	§ 2254	186
4.	Certificates of Appealability	192
5.	Discovery	192
6.	Evidentiary Hearings	192
7.	Interstate Agreement on Detainers Act	194
8.	Juror Misconduct	194
9.	Reconsideration	194
10.	Statutes of Limitations	194
11.	Successive Petitions	195
12.	Writ Ad Testificandum	195
13.	Writ of Coram Nobis	195
III.	Civil Proceedings	196
A.	Introduction	196
1.	Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law	196
2.	Affirming on Alternative Grounds	197
B.	Pretrial Decisions in Civil Cases	197
1.	Absolute Immunity	197
2.	Abstention	198
3.	Affirmative Defenses	199
4.	Amended Complaints	199
5.	Answers	201
6.	Appointment of Counsel	201
7.	Appointment of Guardian Ad Litem	201
8.	Arbitration	202

9.	Bifurcation	204
10.	Burden of Proof	205
11.	Case Management	205
12.	Certification to State Court	206
13.	Claim Preclusion	206
14.	Class Actions	207
15.	Collateral Estoppel	208
16.	Complaints	209
17.	Consolidation	210
18.	Constitutionality of Regulations	211
19.	Constitutionality of Statutes	211
20.	Contempt	212
21.	Continuances	213
22.	Counterclaims	214
23.	Declaratory Relief	214
24.	Discovery	215
25.	Dismissals	218
26.	Disqualifying Counsel	225
27.	Disqualifying the Judge (Recusal)	225
28.	Diversity Jurisdiction	226
29.	Equitable Estoppel	226
30.	Equitable Tolling	227
31.	Evidentiary Hearings	227
32.	Exhaustion	227
33.	Failure to State a Claim	228
34.	Forum Non Conveniens	230
35.	Forum Selection Clauses	230
36.	Frivolousness	231
37.	Immunities	232
38.	Impleader	235
39.	In Forma Pauperis Status	235
40.	Inherent Powers	235
41.	Injunctions	236
42.	Interlocutory Appeals	239
43.	Intervention	239
44.	Involuntary Dismissal	240
45.	Issue Preclusion	241
46.	Joinder/Indispensable Party	241

47.	Judgment on the Pleadings	242
48.	Judicial Estoppel	243
49.	Judicial Notice	243
50.	Jurisdiction	243
51.	Jury Demand	247
52.	Laches	248
53.	Lack of Prosecution	248
54.	Law of the Case	248
55.	Leave to Amend	249
56.	Local Rules	251
57.	Magistrate Judges	252
58.	Mandamus	252
59.	Mootness	253
60.	Oral Argument	254
61.	Pendent Jurisdiction	254
62.	Personal Jurisdiction	255
63.	Preemption	255
64.	Preliminary Injunctions	256
65.	Pretrial Conferences	258
66.	Pretrial Orders	258
67.	Primary Jurisdiction	259
68.	Protective Orders	259
69.	Qualified Immunity	260
70.	Recusal	261
71.	Removal	261
72.	Res Judicata	262
73.	Ripeness	263
74.	Rooker-Feldman Doctrine	264
75.	Sanctions	264
76.	Service of Process	266
77.	Severance	267
78.	Sovereign Immunity	267
79.	Special Masters	268
80.	Standing	269
81.	Stare Decisis	270
82.	Statutes of Limitation	270
83.	Stays	271
84.	Striking	272

85.	Subject Matter Jurisdiction	272
86.	Subpoenas	274
87.	Substitution of Parties	275
88.	Summary Judgment	275
89.	Summons	280
90.	Supplemental Complaints	280
91.	Supplemental Jurisdiction	280
92.	Venue	281
93.	Vexatious Litigants	281
94.	Voir Dire	281
95.	Voluntary Dismissals	282
C.	Trial Decisions in Civil Cases	282
1.	Alter Ego	282
2.	Authentication	283
3.	Bench Trials	283
4.	Best Evidence Rule	284
5.	Bifurcation	284
6.	Choice of Laws	285
7.	Closing Arguments	286
8.	Credibility Findings	286
9.	Cross-Examination	286
10.	Directed Verdict	287
11.	Evidentiary Rulings	287
12.	Experts	289
13.	Federal Rules of Civil Procedure	290
14.	Foreign Law	290
15.	Hearsay	291
16.	Judgment as a Matter of Law	292
17.	Juror Partiality, Bias and Misconduct	292
18.	Jury Instructions	293
19.	Jury Selection	294
20.	Jury Verdicts	295
21.	Opening Statements	297
22.	Parol Evidence	297
23.	Proximate Cause	298
24.	Regulations	298

25.	State Law	299
26.	Statutes	300
27.	Substantive Areas of Law	302
	a. Admiralty	302
	b. Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)	304
	c. Antitrust	305
	d. Bankruptcy	306
	e. Bivens Actions	313
	f. Civil Rights	314
	g. Constitutional Law	317
	h. Contracts	318
	i. Copyright/Trademark	320
	j. Declaratory Judgment Act	323
	k. Defamation	324
	l. Employment Discrimination	325
	m. Environmental Law	328
	n. ERISA	333
	o. Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	336
	p. Fair Labor Standards Act	336
	q. False Claims Act	337
	r. Federal Employers Liability Act (FELA)	338
	s. Federal Tort Claims Act (FTCA)	338
	t. Feres Doctrine	340
	u. Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)	340
	v. Immigration	342
	i. Board of Immigration Appeals	342
	ii. District Court Appeals	351
	w. Individuals with Disabilities Ed. Act	353
	x. Labor Law	354
	y. Negligence	360
	z. Securities	360
	aa. Social Security	363
	bb. Tariffs	365
	cc. Tax	365
	dd. Title VII	368
	ee. Warsaw Convention	370

28.	Supervising Trials	371
29.	Supplemental Jury Instructions	371
30.	Territorial Laws	371
31.	Treaties	372
32.	Tribal Courts	373
33.	Verdict Forms	374
D.	Post-Trial Decisions in Civil Cases	375
1.	Appeals	375
2.	Attorneys Fees	376
a.	Admiralty	377
b.	Americans with Disabilities Act	378
c.	Antitrust	378
d.	Bankruptcy	378
e.	Civil Rights	379
f.	Class Actions	379
g.	Contract Provision	380
h.	Copyright/Trademark	380
i.	Environmental Laws	381
j.	Equal Access to Justice Act (EAJA)	382
k.	ERISA	383
l.	FOIA	384
m.	IDEA	384
n.	Inherent Powers	384
o.	Removal	385
p.	Rule 68	385
q.	Social Security	385
r.	State Law	386
s.	Tax	386
t.	Title VII	386
3.	Bonds	387
4.	Certified Appeals	388
5.	Choice of Remedies	388
6.	Consent Decrees	389
7.	Costs	389

8.	Damages	390
	a. Liquidated	392
	b. Punitive	392
	c. Remittitur	393
9.	Default	394
10.	Equitable Relief	395
11.	Excusable Neglect	396
12.	Fines	396
13.	Interest	396
14.	JNOV	397
15.	Judgments	398
16.	Mandates	400
17.	New Trials	400
18.	Permanent Injunctions	401
19.	Reconsideration	402
20.	Renewed Motion for Judgment as Matter of Law	403
21.	Reopen/Supplement Record	404
22.	Sanctions	405
23.	Settlements	407
24.	Supersedeas Bonds	409
25.	Surety Bonds	409
26.	Vacatur	409
27.	Void Judgments	410
IV.	Review of Agency Decisions	410
A.	Introduction	410
1.	Arbitrary and Capricious	410
2.	Constitutional Review	412
3.	Regulatory Interpretations	413
4.	Sanctions	414
5.	Statutory Interpretations	414
6.	Substantial Evidence	417

B.	Specific Agency Review	418
1.	Bonneville Power Administration	418
2.	Department of Energy	419
3.	Environmental Protection Agency	420
4.	Federal Communications Commission	420
5.	Federal Energy Regulatory Commission	421
6.	Federal Labor Relations Authority	421
7.	Federal Trade Commission	422
8.	Immigration and Naturalization Service	422
9.	Interior Board of Land Appeals	432
10.	Labor Benefits Review Board	432
11.	Mine Safety & Health Review Commission	434
12.	National Labor Relations Board	434
13.	National Transportation Safety Board	436
14.	OSHRC	437
15.	Railroad Retirement Board	438
16.	Railway Adjustment Board	438
17.	Securities Exchange Commission	438
18.	Social Security Administration	439
	INDEX	442